Evaluation of 176 Rennick Road
according to Ontario Regulation 9/06
City of Burlington

Prepared for
Thomas Douglas, Planner – Development Review & Heritage
City of Burlington
426 Brant Street
Burlington, ON L7R 2Z6

By
Archaeological Research Associates Ltd.
219-900 Guelph Street
Kitchener, ON N2H 5Z6
Tel: (519) 804-2291 Fax: (519) 286-0493
www.arch-research.com

05/10/2017

Original
1.0 INTRODUCTION

The City of Burlington has requested that Archaeological Research Associates Ltd. (ARA) assist with the evaluation of the cultural heritage value or interest of 176 Rennick Road according to Ontario Regulation 9/06 (O. Reg. 9/06) to determine if the property is worthy of remaining on the City of Burlington’s Municipal Heritage Register.

This report examines the design of the property, presents its history and describes its context. A site visit was conducted on September 8, 2017. Permission to enter the property was provided in letter form by The Canada Trust Company, who is the sole Estate Trustee (executor) for the Sylvia Walker Estate. Using this information, the cultural heritage value or interest of 176 Rennick Road is evaluated against the criteria prescribed in O. Reg. 9/06 of the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA). A Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest (CHVI) is then provided including a list of heritage attributes.

2.0 PROPERTY INFORMATION

Civic Address: 176 Rennick Road
Common Name: The Stewart-Spence House
Legal Description: Part Lot 5, Concession 2 Township of East Flamborough
Map 1: Study Area in the City of Burlington

(Produced by ARA under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri)
3.0 PHOTOGRAPHS

Map 2: Property Location with Image Locations and Directions at 176 Rennick Road
(Produced by ARA under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri)
Image 1: Façade of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southeast)

Image 2: Detail of façade entryway of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southeast)
Image 3: Detail of façade window opening of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing East)

Image 4: Detail of rusticated stone sill of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing East)
Image 5: Detail of stone construction under stucco of 176 Rennick Road  
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southeast)

Image 6: Detail of where garage addition meets main house of 176 Rennick Road  
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southeast)
Image 7: Northeast Corner of 176 Rennick Road  
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing South)

Image 8: East Elevation of 176 Rennick Road  
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southwest)
Image 9: Southeast Corner of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing West)

Image 10: South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)
Image 11: Detail of garage addition on South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)

Image 12: Detail of south addition on South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southwest)
Image 13: Detail of window and doors on South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)

Image 14: Detail of ground floor window on South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)
Image 15: Detail of window on east side of South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)

Image 16: Detail of second storey window on South Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)
Image 17: Southwest Corner of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing North)

Image 18: West Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing East)
Image 19: Detail of first storey window opening, West Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing East)

Image 20: Detail of second storey of West Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing East)
Image 21: Detail of chimney on the West Elevation of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing East)

Image 22: Northwest Corner of 176 Rennick Road
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Southeast)
Image 23: Landscape view of 176 Rennick Road  
(Photo taken on September 8, 2017; Facing Northwest)
4.0 MAPS

Map 3: Location of 176 Rennick Road, Burlington
(Produced by ARA under licence using ArcGIS® software by Esri, © Esri)
Evaluation of 176 Rennick Road According to O. Reg. 9/06

October 2017 Archaeological Research Associates Ltd.
Evaluation of 176 Rennick Road According to O. Reg. 9/06

October 2017

Archaeological Research Associates Ltd.

Map 5: 176 Rennick Road on the 1875 Map
(McGill University 2001)
Map 6: Historic Aerial Image (1954), Showing the Study Area
(University of Toronto)
5.0 BACKGROUND INFORMATION

5.1 Architecture or Design

- Early one-and-a-half storey vernacular stone structure, now stuccoed;
- Side gable roof with simple return eaves (see Image 1);
- The roofline has been modified with the addition of stilted shed-roof dormers clad with wood siding (see Image 1 and Image 6);
- Two centrally placed cut stone chimneys located at the west and east gable ends of the original portion are extant (see Image 21);
- The original portion of the building (west portion) displays elements of the Georgian style of architecture exemplified by the simple, solid, and symmetrical design (see Image 18);
- The land slopes downward from north to south, creating a bank house (see Image 17);
- Three-bay façade with a centrally placed entryway flanked by asymmetrically placed window openings;
- The wood and glass paneled entryway door of the façade is set in the centre of the original façade in a deep embrasure designed to reflect a simplified ogee arch (see Image 2);
- West elevation is two-bay with symmetrically placed window openings;
- East elevation appeared to also be two-bay with symmetrically placed windows (as seen in the 1971 historic photo, see Image 24 and Image 25)
  - the east elevation is currently obscured by the second storey of the garage addition;
- The eastern portion (garage addition) of the building is an addition and is currently used as a two-car garage
  - the first storey eastern portion was added before 1971 (see Image 24) with an even later addition of a second storey in the form of a wood clad shed roof dormer (see Image 8 and Image 11);
- A square, stuccoed two storey flat roofed addition projects from the middle of the south elevation and is flanked on either side by a large modified window opening;
  - A recent second storey deck to the west of the addition
  - South addition topped with a small porch (see Image 10 and Image 12);
- While the large window openings of the south elevation are likely modified, they both retain a long single stone sill; and
- Window openings in the original portion of the house are rectangular and exhibit stone sills (see Image 3, Image 4 and Image 19).

5.2 History

- Crown Patent for the north half of Lot 5, Concession 2 (100 acres) went to King’s College (predecessor to the University of Toronto) in 1826 (LRO 20);
  - Land patents and subsequent sales provided a means of fundraising;
- John Stewart purchased the north half of the lot (100 acres) from King’s College in 1842 (LRO 20);
John Stewart is enumerated in the Agricultural Census of 1851 as the occupant of Lot 5, Concession 2 in the Township of East Flamborough (LAC 1851);
  - Stewart grew wheat, barley and hay and raised pigs;
- Property was willed to Peter Stewart, though he was a minor at the time so it was held in trust by John Stewart's executors (LRO 20);
- Property deeded to Peter Stewart from the executors of John Stewart in 1873 (LRO 20);
  - Peter Stewart did not reside in the stone house, but rather in a frame house with his mother and siblings (LAC 1861);
- Rachel Spence purchased the property from Peter Stewart in 1875 (LRO 20);
  - According to the 1891 census, the Spence's were residing in a one storey, 11 room stone house on their property (LAC 1891);
    - A second stone house, this one a one-and-a-half storey 6 room house, was unoccupied at the time of the census (LAC 1891);
  - A map from 1903 depicts Rachel R.S. Spence as the occupant of the subject property;
    - Rennick Road is indicated on the lot south of the farmhouse depicted at the foot of the escarpment;
  - Rachel Spence sold the property to her husband William Spence in 1914 (LRO 20);
    - William Spence’s executors sold the property to Hannah Spence in 1919;
- Hannah Spence sold the property to George and Jessie Rennick in 1945 (LRO 20);
- It is likely during the Rennicks ownership of land in the area that the name of the road was changed to reflect their influence;
- George and Jessie Rennick sold a 9.94-acre parcel to William and Sylvia Walker in 1972 (LRO 20);
  - The Rennicks parcelled off parts of the property following their purchase of the land (LRO 20);
- Construction date is thought to be in the early to mid-19th century due to the Georgian influences observed in the buildings design but a precise date cannot be confirmed;
  - 1851 Personal Census for the former Township of Flamborough East has not survived, and the Tax Assessment Roles for the Township cannot be located;
  - The 1832 construction date previously attributed to 176 Rennick Road may have been erroneously attributed. A nearby house at 38 Mountain Brow Road (Mountain Brow House), located on Lot 7, Concession 2, is a stone structure constructed in 1832 and is located just east of the new Waterdown Road (see Map 6);
- One of the earliest houses remaining in the former Township of Flamborough East;
- Architect and/or builder is unknown;
- Mrs. Sylvia Walker owned the property at the time of her death; and
- The current owner is The Canada Trust Company (sole Estate Trustee/Executor).
5.3 Context

- Situated on the former Old Waterdown Road (see Map 6);
- Not visible from the road, the house is set at the end of a long private driveway with a grand view from the Niagara Escarpment;
- Located on a large heavily treed lot with a gently rolling topography; and
- Important in establishing the dominant historic character of the area as a rural farming community.

6.0 EVALUATION OF SIGNIFICANCE

Table 1: Evaluation of the Cultural Heritage Value or Interest of 176 Rennick Road in Accordance with Ontario Regulation 9/06

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criteria</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>✓</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Design or Physical Value</td>
<td>Is a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Displays a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic value</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Displays a high degree of technical or scientific achievement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical or Associative Value</td>
<td>Has direct associations with a theme, event, belief, person, activity, organization or institution that is significant to a community</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yields or has the potential to yield information that contributes to the understanding of a community or culture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Demonstrates or reflects the work or ideas of an architect, builder, artist, designer or theorist who is significant to a community</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contextual Value</td>
<td>Is important in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is physically, functionally, visually or historically linked to its surroundings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Is a landmark</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7.0 STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

Introduction and Description of Property

176 Rennick Road is located on the south side of Rennick Road, east of Old Waterdown Road in the City of Burlington. The property consists of a one-and-a-half storey stuccoed vernacular stone residence constructed pre-1860.
Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest:

Physical/Design Value

176 Rennick Road is representative of an early vernacular structure that has been significantly modified since it’s construction in the early to mid-19th century. The original portion of the building (west portion) displays elements of the Georgian style of architecture exemplified by its simple, solid, and symmetrical design. The one-and-a-half storey stone structure has been stuccoed and features a side gable roof with simple return eaves. The stone used to construct the house may have come from the nearby Niagara Escarpment, which historically provided a good source of stone and was used in the construction of Georgian buildings along the coast of Lake Ontario in this area. Cut stone chimneys are found in the centre of both the west elevation and the east elevation of the original structure, indicating that the house had at least two fire places.

176 Rennick Road features simple rectangular door and window openings and the fenestration exhibited in the side gables is symmetrical. The original portion of the building exhibits window openings with stone sills. A wood and glass paneled front door is set in the centre of the original façade in a deep embrasure designed to reflect a simplified ogee arch.

Contextual Value

176 Rennick Road is one of the earliest houses remaining in the former Township of Flamboro East and is located on the former Old Waterdown Road. Typical of a farmstead, the house is set back and not visible from the road. It is located at the end of a long private driveway with a grand view from the Niagara Escarpment. The house is situated on a large, heavily treed lot with a gently rolling topography. Given its age, 176 Rennick Road is important in establishing the dominant historic character of the area as a rural farming community.

Cultural Heritage Attributes

The heritage attributes that contribute to the cultural heritage value or interest of 176 Rennick Road include, but are not limited to:

- Set back from the road on a large lot with a gently rolling topography;
- Mature trees surrounding the house;
- One-and-a-half storey stone structure;
- Side gable roof with return eaves;
- Two cut stone chimneys;
- Rectangular window and door openings;
- Stone window sills; and
- Wood and glass paneled door set in a deep embrasure reflective of a simplified ogee arch.
8.0 CONCLUSIONS

O. Reg. 9/06 of the OHA requires that to be designated, a property must meet one or more of the criteria grouped into the categories of design or physical value, historical or associative value, and contextual value. 176 Rennick Road meets the criteria for determining CHVI as outlined in O. Reg. 9/06. The City of Burlington’s Draft Official Plan (April 2017) includes policies outlining the conservation of cultural heritage resources’ in section 3.5, and a specific policy (3.5.2.1f) requiring the evaluation of CHVI established by Provincial regulation under the OHA (City of Burlington). As such, the City of Burlington’s Municipal Heritage Committee and Council may consider the designation of the property based on its CHVI.

The property possesses design/physical value as it is representative of an early vernacular structure displaying elements of the Georgian style of architecture. Furthermore, it has contextual value as one of the earliest houses remaining in the former Township of Flamboro East and is important in establishing the dominant historic character of the area as a rural farming community. That said, research suggests that the property possesses little historical or associative value.

The Provincial Policy Statement notes that CHVI is bestowed upon cultural heritage resources by communities (MMAH 2014). Accordingly, the system by which heritage is governed in this province places emphasis on the decision-making of local municipalities in determining CHVI. It is to be hoped that the information presented in this report will be useful in those deliberations.
9.0  BIBLIOGRAPHY AND SOURCES

City of Burlington

Government of Ontario

Gregory, H.

Land Registry Office (LRO) #20–Halton
’Lot 5, Concession 2, Nelson Township’ Abstract Index.

Library and Archives Canada (LAC)

Kyles, S.

McGill University

Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing (MMAH)

Page & Smith
Reeves, W.
1971a “175 Rennick Road, originally Old Waterdown Road, the Stuart - Spence house, 1971 Burlington.” The Burlington Historical Society Digital Collection. Accessed online at: http://images.burlington.halinet.on.ca/8316/data?n=3

Turcotte, Dorothy

Tyrell, J.W.

University of Toronto
1954 Aerial Photo #433.794. Accessed online at: https://mdl.library.utoronto.ca/collections/air-photos/1954-air-photos-southern-ontario/index
Appendix A: Background Material

Image 24: Archival photograph of the Stuart-Spence House, 176 Rennick Road
(Walter Reeves, 1971)

Image 25: Archival photograph of the Stuart-Spence House, 176 Rennick Road
(Walter Reeves, 1971)