

CA-03-19 - Appendix A: Outstanding Audit Issues - as of February 28, 2019

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue						Number		Owner
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	
A	Transportation	Parking Mgmt Service	Parking By-Law Enforcement	19-Apr-18	1D	<p>Significant improvement required (Medium)</p> <p>Beyond the ongoing budget to actual comparisons, the only additional reporting prepared on a regular basis is to report on the performance measures in place within the Parking Management – Service Business Plan. Additional reporting on delivery of parking by-law enforcement is not provided to the Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking or the Director of Transportation Services on a regularly recurring basis, but only as requested.</p> <p>Recommendation: To ensure Parking Management and the overall Transportation Services department is aligned in monitoring and evaluating the delivery of parking by-law enforcement, Management can determine the monthly and/or quarterly statistics that would support ongoing monitoring of progress towards objectives, performance measurement targets and strategic goals and provide the reporting to Senior Management on a pre-determined basis.</p> <p>When completing future business requirements for a new system to eventually revise or replace Ticket Tracer, Parking Management can consider functionality to pull and prepare reports on performance measures within the system and without need for external manipulation or tracking in spreadsheets.</p>	<p>The City agrees with this recommendation. The City will participate in the City's business intelligence program to identify performance measures and relevant monitoring and reporting as related to parking by-law enforcement. This action is dependent on the strategy planning in management response 2A.</p>	31-Mar-19	31-Jul-19	<p>December 31, 2018 No update to report at this time.</p> <p>September 7, 2018: Transportation (Parking) is included in Phase 2 of the Business Intelligence program.</p> <p>June 30, 2018: No action taken to-date.</p> <p>April 30, 2018: Report recently issued. Follow up scheduled as of September 30.</p>	0	1	Supervisor of Parking Services & Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue						Number		Owner
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	
B	Transportation	Parking Mgmt Service	Parking By-Law Enforcement	19-Apr-18	2A	<p>Significant improvement required (Medium)</p> <p>While in the Parking Management – Service Business Plan the service description notes “A public service to manage parking in Burlington”, a parking management strategy has not been documented or consistently articulated. It was also noted that a strategic direction for the desire/target outcomes for parking by-law enforcement has not been formally developed. Without desired outcomes being defined, Parking Management may not have clearly articulated what it is seeking to achieve with respect to parking by-law enforcement, nor the goals and expectations of the service delivery and how to demonstrated progress towards those objectives.</p> <p>Recommendation: Parking Management can determine whether parking by-law enforcement is meant to be a revenue generating or cost recovery service for the City. Once determined, a formalized parking by-law enforcement strategy, refreshed on a regular basis (e.g., annually) in response to parking trends and external factors, can enable Parking Management to take a focused approach to re-evaluate and prioritize its parking by-law enforcement programs and initiatives towards fulfillment of its mandate.</p> <p>Once the parking by-law enforcement strategy has been developed, Parking Management can work to define the key compliance risks as well as the performance goals and standards that can be used to measure and monitor progress against the strategy. The risks can be documented in a risk register (refer to recommendation 1C). The risks that are going to be the focus in a particular year should be referenced in the Parking Management Service Business Plan.</p> <p>The parking by-law enforcement strategy can help increase transparency and strengthen accountability around progress towards strategic priorities of Parking Management. The strategy should be communicated to City stakeholders such as staff within Parking Management and in other service areas, and the contracted Commissionaires.</p> <p>As a result of the strategy development, Parking Management may consider the opportunity to revisit the organizational structure of the service area, including out-sourcing versus in-sourcing and whether the merger of the City’s enforcement officers would provide more value to the City.</p>	<p>The City agrees with this recommendation. The City will conduct a session(s) to identify and document the service strategy to clarify the goals and expectations of parking enforcement and its alignment to Transportation Services. This information will assist in updating the service business plan.</p>	31-Dec-18	31-Jul-19	<p>December 31, 2018 No update to report at this time.</p> <p>September 7, 2018: Staff are reviewing this recommendation and expect to have completed within the revised expected completion date.</p> <p>June 30, 2018 No action taken to-date. Staff will schedule a strategy session(s) when time permits.</p> <p>April 30, 2018: Report recently issued. Follow up scheduled as of September 30.</p>	0	1	Director Transportation & Manager of Transportation Planning and Parking

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue					Number		Owner		
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status		Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised
C	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	1	Medium	<p>Construction Inspection Documentation: The inspector is responsible for completing a daily diary to record key factors and events from on-site construction activities. These pre-printed workbooks have been in use since 2011 to provide a standard for completion. The diaries include a cover page for high-level details of the project (e.g. project number, contractor, inspector, and project start and end dates) and note pages for recording the daily factors and events. These factors and events include information about weather conditions, temperature, daily work progress, labour on site, equipment in use, site visitors, quantity measures, etc. The inspectors use a smaller field memo notebook to record brief notes for later transcription to the diary. (The retention of the field memo notebooks is addressed in Audit Finding #4.)</p> <p>In the sample of projects selected, diaries exist for each project; yet completion of daily diaries is not consistent. The level of detail for projects of similar complexity is inconsistent among inspectors. The factor information (e.g. weather, temperature, labour, and equipment) is not being recorded daily in some diaries. When factor information is recorded, it is inconsistent in detail. Daily records are not consistently signed by inspectors.</p> <p>Also, there were instances of briefing notes in the field memo notebooks not being transcribed to diaries. In some diaries, the notes are difficult to read because of the handwriting.</p> <p>Recommendation 1. Complete a review of the current guidance, involving other inspectors in the creation and update, and create guidelines for construction documentation. Guidance would provide reasons for level of detail required and examples of what is considered appropriate. Also, the use of a line and signature at the end of the notes (as opposed to the bottom of the second page) prevents amendments to notes after the fact. Consider using City of Welland's procedures manual as a base.</p> <p>In conjunction with creating guidance, design and implement a quality assurance process for construction documentation.</p>	Create and update existing procedures for inspectors to include a more detailed outline of required information in the daily logs. This is to include a more standardized sheet in the inspector logs for equipment/labour. Additional emphasis will be put on project managers to review and approve the daily logs on a monthly basis with the addition of required signoffs (daily by inspector on site, monthly by PM reviewing log).	31-Mar-19		<p>December 31, 2018: No change at this time. Work is scheduled to commence on this during the winter down time so that it can be in place at the commencement of the 2019 construction season.</p> <p>October 15, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>			Manager of Design and Construction and Project Manager

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue						Number		Owner	
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due		Times End Date Revised
D	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	4	Medium	<p>Construction Inspection Documentation: Field memo books are used by inspectors to make brief notes of on-site activity for transcription to more detailed notes in the construction diary. These memo books have not been categorized according to the Records Retention by-law, so the appropriate retention has not been determined. Currently, the field memo books are kept by the inspectors for extended periods and are not stored with other project documents.</p> <p>Construction diaries are kept by, and with, the inspector until the project is complete (that is, until deficiencies have been corrected). For three of the projects considered complete (that is, the project documents were in off-site storage), the construction diaries remained with the inspector rather than with the project documentation.</p> <p>Recommendation:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review the Records Retention By-law to determine the appropriate category for field memo books. Once determined, document the business rationale for the decision including what is considered the trigger event and final disposition of documents, communicate to staff, and implement the appropriate disposition for existing field memo books. As a suggestion, you may want to review "Transitory Records" to see if this description is appropriate for these documents. 2. Update guidance to include when and where final construction diaries are to be stored. Create and implement use a checklist to ensure key elements of the project files are appropriately retained and stored. 3. Collect construction diaries for project files already off-site and include in files (details of affected projects provided separately). 	Confirm the process required for the retention of Field memo books and include procedure for all field documentation in the project close out process.	30-Jun-19		<p>December 31, 2018: No change at this time.</p> <p>October 15, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>			Manager of Design and Construction
E	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	1	Medium	<p>There is no overall long-term (3 to 5 year) strategy and implementation plan to describe: The City's current environment, The goals, objectives and principles for future state of health, safety and wellness within the City, How these goals and objectives align to corporate strategy, The level of risk the organization is willing to tolerate with respect to health, safety and wellness, The programs, resources, and timelines needed to accomplish the objectives, and Relevant leading and lagging performance measures.</p> <p>Recommendations: Conduct a facilitated strategy workshop involving stakeholders (i.e. JHSC representation, directors/managers, employees) to identify and formulate the key goals and objectives for health, safety and wellness in the City, considering broader strategic goals and legislative requirements. This discussion could start with strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats to describe the current environment and support discussion of future state and the desired timeframe for achieving future state. Reference to the DuPont™ Bradley Curve™ may provide some guidance to defining the future state.</p>	We will conduct meetings involving the various stakeholders to identify and formulate vision and 3-5 year strategy for HS&W in the City, considering broader strategic goals and legislative requirements.	31-Dec-19		February 28, 2019: Report recently issued.			Health and Safety Coordinator

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue						Number		Owner	
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due		Times End Date Revised
F	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	43437	4	Medium	<p>Training - Ont Reg 297/13: OHSA&T defines basic requirements for workers and supervisors. For 6 of the 48 employees' training records, at least one of the required awareness or WHMIS courses have not been completed. In one case, the supervisor awareness training was not assigned, and the employee has been a supervisor for at least 3 years. In 2 cases, the worker awareness training was assigned yet not completed, and the employees have worked for the City for over 3 years. In the remaining 3 cases, the WHMIS training was assigned yet not completed, and one employee is new to the City and the other 2 have been with the city for over 4 years.</p> <p>CHSS Communication- Within the sample of employees, the assigned review for communications of corporate health and safety standards is inconsistent. Five of the 48 employees have not completed review of CHSS communications as assigned through OTR.</p> <p>Monitoring - Close to 20% of the sampled employees had some form of incomplete event, be it training or review of CHSS. Through interviews, it is apparent there is a weakness in the monitoring process.</p> <p>Recommendation: Re-confirm business rules for assigning training and CHSS communications through OTR.</p> <p>Distribute exception reporting to people managers/supervisors first. Set a threshold for length of time incomplete (e.g. 3 months) for escalation to director of department and director of HR.</p> <p>Re-affirm with employees and people managers their responsibility for completing training, reviewing communications, and monitoring and follow up of training, is a component of performing successfully in their role.</p>	Departments must ensure that their staff completes the required training and sign-offs. Monthly exception reports to now be sent to Managers through Our Training Room as well as the Directors (already occurring). In June 2019, Corporate Health and Safety Standards will be on the BLT agenda (re: implementation successes and challenges). H&S to further investigate legislated training deficiencies and notify management accordingly.	30-Jun-19		February 28, 2019: Report recently issued.			Health and Safety Coordinator
G	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	3	Low	<p>Cooperative Student Program: The City participates in a cooperative student program to provide hands on learning to college students and help prepare the students for entry into the workforce. Once corporate orientation and training is complete, students are assigned to the survey team or an inspector. Learning objectives and delegated tasks are the responsibility of the survey team leader or the inspector.</p> <p>While engaged students spoke highly of their opportunity to learn hands on, learning objectives are not clear and there is no guidance/orientation for inspectors who are assigned students as to expectations of the City and the students.</p> <p>Recommendation: Develop clear learning objectives for the students (i.e. skills and knowledge they are expected to apply) and provide guidance for inspectors who are assigned students (e.g. limits of what student can be expected to do, how students time is to be managed, etc.)</p>	A more formal plan for utilizing a co-op student will be created to aid the inspector and student in achieving their goals. This can be included in the interview/candidate selection process to ensure that we know what the student's goals are for the co-op term.	31-Mar-19		<p>December 31, 2018: Staff are working with Mohawk CO OP to develop a better screening program for students working at the City. This will be in place for the 2019 student selection.</p> <p>October 15, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>			Manager of Design and Construction

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue						Number		Owner	
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due		Times End Date Revised
H	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	5	Low	<p>Contractor performance evaluations: Contractor performance is assessed on 4 major categories as described in the tender document. Inspectors are responsible for completing the contractor performance evaluation including the overall performance rating and recommendation regarding future work with the City. In 4 of 8 design & construction projects, the signed contractor's performance evaluation could not be located. Also, the process for retaining contractor performance evaluations includes duplication of effort and resources.</p> <p>Recommendation: 1. Confirm contractor evaluations were completed for identified projects (information provided separately) and if not, given the passage of time, determine if necessary to create and document performance. 2. Streamline process for retention of contractor performance evaluations by eliminating duplicate tasks and record keeping.</p>	Ensure all contractor performance evaluations are completed at project closeout and filed in a central location. Outstanding evaluations will be sent to contractor for signoff to be completed and filed.	Immediate		<p>December 31, 2018: Forms have been completed by Staff and are awaiting receipt and contractor signoff.</p> <p>October 15, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>			Project Manager
I	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	6	Low	<p>Inspector Hours of Work: The Employment Standards Act, 2000 (ESA) provides the minimum standards for most employees working in Ontario. It sets out the rights and responsibilities of employees and employers in most Ontario workplaces. According to ESA, the inspectors work at construction sites but do not do road construction work, so their hours are aligned with the standard ESA rules. These rules include an employee must receive at least 11 consecutive hours off work each day.</p> <p>For one inspector, there were 3 instances in 2017 and 1 instance in 2016 when this rule was not followed. Where 11 hours is expected, this employee experienced two instances of having 10.5 hours and 1 instance each of having only 7 hours, 8 hours, and 9 hours respectively.</p> <p>Recommendation: 1. Include the 11-hour rule when considering approval of overtime. There is an interactive tool available online to assist in understanding how this requirement can be met.</p>	Staff will review the classification with respect to the ESA for inspectors working in road construction and ensure that the time off rules between shifts is followed. This problem only occurs when working nights (leading into or coming off night paving) so a plan will be put in place to ensure adequate coverage and communicated with all project teams.	Immediate		<p>December 31, 2018: Complete.</p> <p>Auditor's Note: item will be closed upon confirmation of plan details and communication to project teams.</p> <p>October 15, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>			Manager of Design and Construction
J	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	2	Low	<p>Information on the Health, Safety & Wellness web page includes a listing of safety standards created prior to 2017 and those created after 2017. The pre-2017 safety standards are also published on the P&R web page. The Health, Safety & Wellness web page also contains an orientation guide (dated 2013).</p> <p>There is duplication of topics and varied level of detail in the pre-2017 and post-2017 standards, and the information in the orientation guide is out of date.</p> <p>Recommendations: - Review the pre-2017 standards to the post-2017 standards to eliminate known duplication. - Work with stakeholders to create links to the health, safety and wellness web page for master source information. - Remove the orientation guide from the web page.</p>	We will remove pre-2017 Standards and the old orientation guide and coordinate with P&R to link to the HS&W intranet page for the most up-to-date source of information and Standards. A link to the HS&W intranet page will be created in the "HEALTH AND SAFETY" folder on the S: drive.	30-Jun-19		February 28, 2019: Report recently issued.			Health and Safety Coordinator

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Details of Audit Issue						Number		Owner	
					Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due		Times End Date Revised
K	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	3	Low	<p>The OHSA §12 requires certification of at least one each of the employer and worker representatives. Of the 7 JHSC committees, the Tyandaga committee does not have the required certified member representing management.</p> <p>Recommendations: Send management representative for certification training or, as permitted under the OHSA §9(9), have a certified management representative from a different committee join the Tyandaga committee.</p>	Supervisor – Tyandaga Golf Course to become certified. In the interim, another certified management member will be assigned to this committee	30-Sep-19		February 28, 2019: Report recently issued.			Supervisor – Tyandaga Golf Course
L	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	5	low	<p>Job Hazard Analysis/Safe Job Procedures Refresher Review- The SJPs are equipment-specific with some equipment used on a seasonal basis. The initial publication/implementation of an SJP requires sign-off as to review and understanding. The CHSS for safe job procedures is silent on the requirements for subsequent "refresher" review.</p> <p>Digital Storage - Given the departmental responsibility for SJPs, digital retention tends to occur within department folders/files. There is no centralized inventory of current SJPs.</p> <p>Recommendations: In consultation with stakeholders, determine if a refresher review is required, and if so, the guidelines to prompt the review.</p> <p>Work with the SJP owners to determine a method for joint storage of SJPs.</p>	SJP refresher sign-off will be tabled at a BLT meeting in June as it will require support from management to implement. We can establish a dedicated location in the "HEALTH AND SAFETY" folder on the S: drive for SJPs by department. Caution should be exercised as equipment and processes may vary between departments, even if it appears to be similar.	31-Dec-19		February 28, 2019: Report recently issued.			Health and Safety Coordinator