

CA-14-19 - Appendix A: Outstanding High- and Low-Risk Audit Issues - as of August 31, 2019

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Details of Audit Issue				Number	
								Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
A	Fire	Communications	Fire Emergency Communications	1-Mar-19	4	High	<p>Quality Assurance of Call Taking and Dispatch: Fire 911 Communications is compliant with Section 7.7 of NFPA 1221 (Standard for the Installation, Maintenance, and Use of Emergency Services Communications Systems) because a standard operating guideline (SOG) exists and QA is performed on requested calls. The intent of the standard is not met because the SOG is dated with a last revision date of May 15, 2013, contains guidance or actions no longer relevant or that have changed, and is silent on parameters for the QA process (e.g. the percentage of calls to review, the frequency of the review, etc.).</p> <p>The SOG requires the supervisor to maintain a list of QA work performed including the category of incident reviewed, the telecommunicator's name and a grading of: Met Standards or Did Not Meet Standards - Coaching Provided. This list is not being maintained and it can not be determined if the Supervisor has performed QA on calls handled by each Telecommunicator.</p> <p>Fourteen calls were sampled for call taking and call dispatch to assess compliance with quality assurance standards.</p> <p>Recommendations: Update the quality assurance process with activities and parameters (e.g. frequency, number of calls to review, expected completion timelines, reporting requirements, etc.) required if adopting the APCO/NENA ANS 1,107.1,2015 Standard for the Establishment of a Quality Assurance and Quality Improvement Program for Public Safety Answering Points, then determine the capacity needed to complete the QA as designed and work with the Supervisor to ensure this time is built into schedules.</p>	29-Nov-19		<p>Comments: Somewhat agree, non-emergency lines are answered "fire department", while emergency lines are answered "fire emergency". In November 2018, there was change made to how PSTs answer the fire emergency lines to ask for what city, due to the requirements of the new CAD system. The CAD system populates with the ANI/ALI information the majority of the time; however, the city/location is verified when the call is answered. As with any change in procedure, there is a time of adjustment for personnel. The Centre will continue to answer the non-emergency line with "fire department", the Centre does not recommend that a non-emergency line be answered as an emergency line.</p> <p>Action Plan: As previously mentioned, QA work has already started and was put on hold due to other time sensitive priorities and workload capacity in 2018. QA is done on an ongoing basis for major emergency calls and fire telecommunicator performance call handling times. The fire department was involved with phase one of the Business Intelligence (BI) dashboard build project, and telecommunicator performance measures dashboard was built as part of this initiative, which allows for individual or group performance times review on an ongoing basis. The QA/QI model being created supports best practice recommendations provided from APCO 1,107.1,2015 Standard (as outlined above). Performance times are also reviewed as part of a telecommunicators annual performance evaluation. NFPA 1221 is used to measure the Centre's performance and is built into the dashboard as the establish performance target, screen capture of dashboard provided below for reference. In 2019, the focus of the work will be to align Burlington fire dispatch centre quality assurance to APCO best practice recommendations and to formalize the processes to ensure QA supports continuous improvement within the Centre.</p>	0	Deputy Fire Chief	
							<p>October 9, 2019: New communications supervisor to be enrolled in APCO supervisor program</p> <p>Auditor's Comment: Follow up will continue until evidence new QA process reflecting APCO standards is in place.</p> <p>August 2, 2019: 1100.049 – Quality Assurance Fire Communications Centre issued (July 18, 2019)</p> <p>Next follow up: August 30, 2019</p> <p>April 2019: report recently issued, Regular follow-up scheduled for end of June.</p>						

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Number		
												Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	
B	Fire	Communications	Fire Emergency Communications	1-Mar-19	2	High	<p>Business Continuity: In 2017, Fire 911 Communications identified the lack of a permanent secondary location for public safety communications as a risk. Throughout 2018, work was underway to create an alternate site to support service continuity in the event the primary site is deemed inoperable. The pace of development has slowed considerably during 2018 given other priorities including focus on new CAD implementation and providing fire dispatch service delivery to another municipality within the Region of Halton.</p> <p>An evacuation box is prepared and maintained with the necessary materials needed for manual dispatching of calls from another location. The current arrangement with another public safety agency for use of space and systems/equipment are significantly different. Evacuation of the center is a critical risk.</p> <p>Recommendations: Burlington Fire Department re-prioritize projects to put completion of the alternate site as the primary focus including updating the business continuity plan and establishing regular testing of the processes and systems (i.e. on-going operations).</p> <p>Strong coordination with IT to ensure resources are available to support the technology work necessary to complete the alternate site and maintain the technology through its life cycle.</p>	<p>Establish a permanent alternate location to provide fire dispatch service delivery with the least amount of disruption time. The alternate location will be established to support both long-term and short-term disruptions in service. This is the highest priority project for the fire department and has the support of IT services. The IT Workplan Roadmap also lists this as a priority project. Fire has two (2) IT personnel that will provide key support of this project through completion. Capital Works is also involved with the project to build out additional space and fit ups of room, excluding IT technology requirements. Funding has been approved for this project.</p>	31-Dec-19		<p>October 9, 2019 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The alternate dispatch location is completed and is going through active CAD testing. The development of an ITS workplan will identify technology and software updates and or replacement. This includes NEXT GEN 911. <p><i>Auditor's Comment:</i> Follow up will continue until scale, scope and frequency of testing of the alternate dispatch equipment, location and personnel staffing are documented and implemented.</p> <p>August 2, 2019: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The alternate dispatch location has been renovated and is ready to receive equipment. CAD computers (4) have arrived and are going through CAD testing. dispatch consoles have been ordered, and are expected to be delivered by the end of August 2019 cables, network drops, Bell phone lines have been installed and are in situ. Back up dispatch testing September 17, 2019. <p>Next follow up: August 31, 2019</p> <p>April 2019: report recently issued. Regular follow-up scheduled for end of June.</p> </p></p>	0		Owner Deputy Fire Chief

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Details of Audit Issue		
											Status	Days Past Due	Number Times End Date Revised
C	Transportation	Parking Mgmt Service	Parking By-Law Enforcement	19-Apr-18	1D	Significant improvement required (Medium)	<p>Parking Management does not provide regular reports to Senior Management or City Council on parking performance metrics, although they do provide an annual budget of information and responses to ad hoc requests.</p> <p>Beyond the ongoing budget to actual comparisons, the only additional reporting prepared on a regular basis is to report on the performance measures in place within the Parking Management – Service Business Plan. Additional reporting on delivery of parking by-law enforcement is not provided to the Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking or the Director of Transportation Services on a regularly recurring basis, but only as requested.</p> <p>Recommendation: To ensure Parking Management and the overall Transportation Services department is aligned in monitoring and evaluating the delivery of parking by-law enforcement, Management can determine the monthly and/or quarterly statistics that would support ongoing monitoring of progress towards objectives, performance measurement targets and strategic goals and provide the reporting to Senior Management on a pre-determined basis.</p> <p>When completing future business requirements for a new system to eventually revise or replace Ticket Tracer, Parking Management can consider functionality to pull and prepare reports on performance measures within the system and without need for external manipulation or tracking in spreadsheets</p>	<p>The City agrees with this recommendation. The City will participate in the City's business intelligence program to identify performance measures and relevant monitoring and reporting as related to parking by-law enforcement. This action is dependent on the strategy, planning in management response 2A.</p>	31-Mar-19	31-Jul-19	150	1	
							<p>October 11, 2019 Parking Services has been actively working with the BI team (Clare Cameron). The project is currently in the testing phase of the dashboards and software with working dashboards expected to be in place by the end of October.</p> <p>Clare Cameron will be in attendance on September 26th, 2019, at our next DPC (Downtown Parking Committee) to discuss the progress of the project.</p> <p><i>Auditor's Comment:</i> Follow up will occur at end of October for confirmation of final dashboard.</p> <p>April 30, 2019: Due to recent staff changes, the new Supervisor of Parking Services is being brought up to speed in regard to the Audit.</p> <p>Parking Services is actively working with BI (Fabi Karimullah) in the development of a dashboard to assist with monitoring parking utilization in the downtown and geographically pinpoint ticket issuance. The intent of this BI initiative is to permit Parking Services plan for future enforcement delivery/Meeting scheduled on May 16th to review BI work completed to-date. Note that there have been staffing changes on the BI team which have impacted timelines for delivery.</p> <p>Next follow up: August 31, 2019</p> <p>December 31, 2018 No update to report at this time.</p> <p>September 7, 2018: Transportation (Parking) is included in Phase 2 of the Business Intelligence program.</p> <p>June 30, 2018: No action taken to-date.</p> <p>April 30, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>	<p>Supervisor of Parking Services & Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking</p>					

Ref #	Department	Function Service	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Details of Audit Issue		Number	
											Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
D	Transportation	Parking Mgmt Service	Parking By-Law Enforcement	19-Apr-18	2A	Significant improvement required (Medium)	<p>Summary</p> <p>While in the Parking Management – Service Business Plan the service description notes "A public service to manage parking in Burlington", a parking management strategy has not been documented or consistently articulated. It was also noted that a strategic direction for the desired target outcomes for parking by-law enforcement has not been formally developed. Without desired outcomes being defined, Parking Management may not have clearly articulated what it is seeking to achieve with respect to parking by-law enforcement, nor the goals and expectations of the service delivery and how to demonstrate progress towards those objectives.</p> <p>Recommendation:</p> <p>Parking Management can determine whether parking by-law enforcement is meant to be a revenue generating or cost recovery service for the City. Once determined, a formalized parking by-law enforcement strategy, refreshed on a regular basis (e.g., annually) in response to parking trends and external factors, can enable Parking Management to take a focused approach to re-evaluate and prioritize its parking by-law enforcement programs and initiatives towards fulfillment of its mandate.</p> <p>Once the parking by-law enforcement strategy has been developed, Parking Management can work to define the key compliance risks as well as the performance goals and standards that can be used to measure and monitor progress against the strategy. The risks can be documented in a risk register (refer to recommendation 1C). The risks that are going to be the focus in a particular year should be referenced in the Parking Management Service Business Plan.</p> <p>The parking by-law enforcement strategy can help increase transparency and strengthen accountability around progress towards strategic priorities of Parking Management. The strategy should be communicated to City stakeholders such as staff within Parking Management and in other service areas, and the contracted Commissionaires.</p> <p>As a result of the strategy development, Parking Management may consider the opportunity to revisit the organizational structure of the service area, including out-sourcing versus in-sourcing and whether the merger of the City's enforcement officers would provide more value to the City.</p>	<p>October 11, 2019: CRM 'Go Live' for Transportation Services was September 10th. Due to the major changes of business service we have no update at this point in time.</p> <p>There has also been staff changes resulting in a new Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking that needs to be 'brought up to speed' in regards to the Audit.</p> <p><i>Auditor's Comments:</i> as per management's comments in CA-14-19, there is a vision for parking enforcement and a renewed commitment to making the changes and amendments in operations to achieve the vision.</p> <p>April 30, 2019: Customer Relationship Management (CRM) is rolling out through Parking Services in July, 2019. As a result of forthcoming changes to service delivery, we will be waiting until post-CRM before initiating the review of Enforcement Services.</p> <p>Next follow up: August 31, 2019</p> <p>December 31, 2018: No update to report at this time.</p> <p>September 7, 2018: Staff are reviewing this recommendation and expect to have completed within the revised expected completion date.</p> <p>June 30, 2018: No action taken to-date. Staff will schedule a strategy session(s) when time permits.</p> <p>April 30, 2018: Report recently issued.</p>	240	2	Director Transportation & Manager of Transportation Planning and Parking			

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Number		
												Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	
E	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	1	Medium	<p>Summary</p> <p>There is no overall long-term (3 to 5 year) strategy and implementation plan to describe:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The City's current environment, - The goals, objectives and principles for future state of health, safety and wellness within the City, - How these goals and objectives align to corporate strategy, - The level of risk the organization is willing to tolerate with respect to health, safety and wellness, - The programs, resources, and timelines needed to accomplish the objectives, and - Relevant leading and lagging performance measures. <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>Conduct a facilitated strategy workshop involving stakeholders (i.e. JHSC representation, directors/managers, employees) to identify and formulate the key goals and objectives for health, safety and wellness in the City, considering broader strategic goals and legislative requirements. This discussion could start with strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats to describe the current environment and support discussion of future state and the desired timeframe for achieving future state. Reference to the DuPont™ Bradley Curve™ may provide some guidance to defining the future state.</p>	<p>We will conduct meetings involving the various stakeholders to identify and formulate vision and 3-5 year strategy for HS&W in the City, considering broader strategic goals and legislative requirements.</p>	31-Dec-19		<p>August 31, 2019: First strategy workshop with stakeholders from workplaces across the city on June 28, 2019; the session was led by Thomas Plant of the City's Project Management Office. This workshop included a SWOT analysis activity, which was used as the basis for forming a draft document that identifies a vision statement and proposed strategic goals and initiatives (drafted by the PMO's office). Part 2 of the Strategy Workshop will be held on November 1st to validate the document's content and to develop an action plan with stakeholders.</p> <p>Remains on track for the targeted completion date of December 31, 2019.</p> <p>May 28, 2019: A strategy workshop session is scheduled for June 28, with staff from all levels of the organization and various departments.</p> <p>Next follow up: August 31, 2019</p> <p>April 30, 2019: An email has been sent to 20 staff from across the City to participate in strategy workshops. Thomas Plant from our Project Management Office has agreed to assist us in conducting the strategy workshop(s). Lagging Indicators (measures) have been reported to BLT and various JHSCs.</p> <p>February 28, 2019: Report recently issued.</p>	0	0	Owner Health and Safety Coordinator
F	Fire	Communications	Fire Emergency Communications	1-Mar-19	3	Medium	<p>Issue Identification, Tracking & Reporting:</p> <p>Issues can occur with people, process or technology. System-related issues are submitted through the City's IT Helpdesk software enabling tracking, notification of closure, and trend analysis. Other issues are communicated verbally or through email between either of the platoon chiefs or public safety telecommunicators and the supervisor. Email tends to be the primary method of communication because of the shift work. The content of the emails varies depending on the issue and submitter. The supervisor began simple tracking of the requests in latter part of 2018. A standardized issue reporting process and feedback loop are not in place.</p> <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>Define and implement a standardized process and tools for reporting, tracking, recording resolution, and communicating to support trend analysis and information sharing for all service clients.</p>	<p>To investigate tools or systems that could be implemented to improve the process for reporting, tracking and recording resolutions of issues. If funding is required for a solution, this will be submitted as part of the 2020 budget process for Council's consideration.</p> <p>In the interim, an Excel spreadsheet has been set up in a restricted shared fire department folder for reporting, tracking and recording resolution of issues. This interim solution will remain in place until a long-term viable solution can be implemented.</p>	31-Jul-20		<p>October 9, 2019: Standardized processes include: • Tri-party quarterly dispatch meetings with Oakville Fire, Halton Hills Fire • Weekly Supervisor meeting (one on one) • Quarterly Divisional meetings with all communications staff. • Monthly extended management team meetings with divisional supervisors.</p> <p><i>Auditor's Comment:</i> Follow up to continue to determine use of spreadsheet given turnover in supervisory staff.</p> <p>April 2019: report recently issued. Regular follow-up scheduled for end of August</p>	0	0	Deputy Fire Chief