CA-06-19 - Appendix A: Outstanding Audit Issues - as of April 30, 2019

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
							Details of Audit Issue					**Number**		
A	Fire	Communications	Fire Emergency Communications	1-Mar-19	4	High	**Quality Assurance of Call Taking and Dispatch:** Technically, Fire 911 Communications is compliant with Section 7.7 of NFPA 1221 (Standard for the Installation, Maintenance, and Use of Emergency Services Communications Systems) because a standard operating guideline (SOG) exists and QA is performed on requested calls. The intent of the standard is not met because the SOG is dated with a last revision date of May 15, 2013, contains guidance or actions no longer relevant or that have changed, and is silent on parameters for the QA process (e.g. the percentage of calls to review, the frequency of the review, etc.). The SOG requires the supervisor to maintain a list of QA work performed including the category of incident reviewed, the telecommunicator's name and a grading of: Met Standards or Did Not Meet Standards - Coaching Provided. This list is not being maintained and it can not be determined if the Supervisor has performed QA on calls handled by each Telecommunicator. Fourteen calls were sampled for call taking and call dispatch to assess compliance with quality assurance standards. **Recommendations:** Update the quality assurance process with activities and parameters (e.g. frequency, number of calls to review, expected completion timelines, reporting requirements, etc.) required. If adopting the APCO/NENA ANS 1.107.1.2015 Standard for the Establishment of a Quality Assurance and Quality Improvement Program for Public Safety Answering Points, then determine the capacity needed to complete the QA as designed and work with the Supervisor to ensure this time is built into schedules.	**Comments:** Somewhat agree, non-emergency lines are answered "fire department", while emergency lines are answer "fire emergency". In November 2018, there was change made to how PSTs answer the fire emergency lines to ask for what city, due to the requirements of the new CAD system. The CAD system populates with the ANI/ALI information the majority of the time; however, the city/location is verified when the call in answered. As with any change in procedure, there is a time of adjustment for personnel. The Centre will continue to answer the non-emergency line with "fire department", the Centre does not recommend that a non-emergency line be answered as an emergency line. **Action Plan:** As previously mentioned, QA work has already started and was put on hold due to other time sensitive priorities and workload capacity in 2018. QA is done on an ongoing basis for major emergency calls and fire telecommunicator performance call handling times. The fire department was involved with phase one of the Business Intelligence (BI) dashboard build project, and telecommunicator performance measures dashboard was built as part of this initiative, which allows for individual or group performance times review on an ongoing basis. The QA/QI model being created supports best practice recommendations provided from APCO 1.107.1.2015 Standard (as outlined above). Performance times are also reviewed as part of a telecommunicators annual performance evaluation. NFPA 1221 is used to measure the Centre's performance and is built into the dashboard as the establish performance target, screen capture of dashboard provided below for reference. In 2019, the focus of the work will be to align Burlington fire dispatch centre quality assurance to APCO best practice recommendations and to formalize the processes to ensure QA supports continuous improvement within the Centre.	29-Nov-19		**April 2019:** report recently issued. Regular follow-up scheduled for end of June.	0		Manager Fire Administration and Communications

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
							Details of Audit Issue					**Number**		
B	Fire	Communications	Fire Emergency Communications	1-Mar-19	2	High	**Business Continuity:** In 2017, Fire 911 Communications identified the lack of a permanent secondary location for public safety communications as a risk. Throughout 2018, work was underway to create an alternate site to support service continuity in the event the primary site is deemed inoperable. The pace of development has slowed considerably during 2018 given other priorities including focus on new CAD implementation and providing fire dispatch service delivery to another municipality within the Region of Halton. An evacuation box is prepared and maintained with the necessary materials needed for manual dispatching of calls from another location. The current arrangement with another public safety agency for use of space and systems/equipment is no longer feasible as systems/equipment are significantly different. Evacuation of the center is a critical risk. **Recommendations:** Burlington Fire Department re-prioritize projects to put completion of the alternate site as the primary focus including updating the business continuity plan and establishing regular testing of the processes and systems (i.e. on-going operations). Strong coordination with IT to ensure resources are available to support the technology work necessary to complete the alternate site and maintain the technology through its life cycle.	Establish a permanent alternate location to provide fire dispatch service delivery with the least amount of disruption time. The alternate location will be established to support both long-term and short-term disruptions in service. This is the highest priority project for the fire department and has the support of IT services. The IT Workplan Roadmap also lists this as a priority project. Fire has two (2) IT personnel that will provide key support of this project through completion. Capital Works is also involved with the project to build out additional space and fit ups of room, excluding IT technology requirements. Funding has been approved for this project.	31-Dec-19		**April 2019:** report recently issued. Regular follow-up scheduled for end of June.	0		Manager Fire Administration and Communications
C	Transportation	Parking Mgmt Service	Parking By-Law Enforcement	19-Apr-18	1D	Significant improvement required (Medium)	Parking Management does not provide regular reports to Senior Management or City Council on parking performance metrics, although they do provide an annual budget of information and responses to ad hoc requests. Beyond the ongoing budget to actual comparisons, the only additional reporting prepared on a regular basis is to report on the performance measures in place within the Parking Management – Service Business Plan. Additional reporting on delivery of parking by-law enforcement is not provided to the Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking or the Director of Transportation Services on a regularly recurring basis, but only as requested. **Recommendation:** To ensure Parking Management and the overall Transportation Services department is aligned in monitoring and evaluating the delivery of parking by-law enforcement, Management can determine the monthly and/or quarterly statistics that would support ongoing monitoring of progress towards objectives, performance measurement targets and strategic goals and provide the reporting to Senior Management on a pre-determined basis. When completing future business requirements for a new system to eventually revise or replace Ticket Tracer, Parking Management can consider functionality to pull and prepare reports on performance measures within the system and without need for external manipulation or tracking in spreadsheets.	The City agrees with this recommendation. The City will participate in the City's business intelligence program to identify performance measures and relevant monitoring and reporting as related to parking by-law enforcement. This action is dependent on the strategy planning in management response 2A.	31-Mar-19	31-Jul-19	**April 30, 2019:** Due to recent staff changes, the new Supervisor of Parking Services is being 'brought up to speed' in regard to the Audit. Parking Services is actively working with BI (Fabi Karimullah) in the development of a dashboard to assist with monitoring parking utilization in the downtown and geographically pinpoint ticket issuance. The intent of this BI initiative is to permit Parking Services plan for future enforcement delivery Meeting scheduled on May 16th to review BI work completed to-date. Note that there have been staffing changes on the BI team which have impacted timelines for delivery. **December 31, 2018** No update to report at this time. **September 7, 2018:** Transportation (Parking) is included in Phase 2 of the Business Intelligence program. **June 30, 2018:** No action taken to-date. **April 30, 2018:** Report recently issued.	30	1	Supervisor of Parking Services & Manager of Transportation Planning & Parking

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
							Details of Audit Issue					**Number**		
D	Transportation	Parking Mgmt Service	Parking By-Law Enforcement	19-Apr-18	2A	Significant improvement required (Medium)	While in the Parking Management – Service Business Plan the service description notes "A public service to manage parking in Burlington", a parking management strategy has not been documented or consistently articulated. It was also noted that a strategic direction for the desire/target outcomes for parking by-law enforcement has not been formally developed. Without desired outcomes being defined, Parking Management may not have clearly articulated what it is seeking to achieve with respect to parking by-law enforcement, nor the goals and expectations of the service delivery and how to demonstrated progress towards those objectives. Recommendation: Parking Management can determine whether parking by-law enforcement is meant to be a revenue generating or cost recovery service for the City. Once determined, a formalized parking by-law enforcement strategy, refreshed on a regular basis (e.g., annually) in response to parking trends and external factors, can enable Parking Management to take a focused approach to re-evaluate and prioritize its parking by-law enforcement programs and initiatives towards fulfillment of its mandate. Once the parking by-law enforcement strategy has been developed, Parking Management can work to define the key compliance risks as well as the performance goals and standards that can be used to measure and monitor progress against the strategy. The risks can be documented in a risk register (refer to recommendation 1C). The risks that are going to be the focus in a particular year should be referenced in the Parking Management Service Business Plan. The parking by-law enforcement strategy can help increase transparency and strengthen accountability around progress towards strategic priorities of Parking Management. The strategy should be communicated to City stakeholders such as staff within Parking Management and in other service areas, and the contracted Commissionaires. As a result of the strategy development, Parking Management may consider the opportunity to revisit the organizational structure of the service area, including out-sourcing versus in-sourcing and whether the merger of the City's enforcement officers would provide more value to the City.	The City agrees with this recommendation. The City will conduct a session(s) to identify and document the service strategy to clarify the goals and expectations of parking enforcement and its alignment to Transportation Services. This information will assist in updating the service business plan.	31-Dec-18	31-Jul-19	**April 30, 2019:** Customer Relationship Management (CRM) is rolling out through Parking Services in July, 2019. As a result of forthcoming changes to service delivery, we will be waiting until post-CRM before initiating the review of Enforcement Services. **December 31, 2018** No update to report at this time. **September 7, 2018:** Staff are reviewing this recommendation and expect to have completed within the revised expected completion date. **June 30, 2018** No action taken to-date. Staff will schedule a strategy session(s) when time permits. **April 30, 2018:** Report recently issued. Follow up scheduled as of September 30.	120	1	Director Transportation & Manager of Transportation Planning and Parking

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
							Details of Audit Issue					**Number**		
E	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	1	Medium	**Construction Inspection Documentation:** The inspector is responsible for completing a daily diary to record key factors and events from on-site construction activities. These pre-printed workbooks have been in use since 2011 to provide a standard for completion. The diaries include a cover page for high-level details of the project (e.g. project number, contractor, inspector, and project start and end dates) and note pages for recording the daily factors and events. These factors and events include information about weather conditions, temperature, daily work progress, labour on site, equipment in use, site visitors, quantity measures, etc. The inspectors use a smaller field memo notebook to record brief notes for later transcription to the diary. (The retention of the field memo notebooks is addressed in Audit Finding #4.) In the sample of projects selected, diaries exist for each project; yet completion of daily diaries is not consistent. The level of detail for projects of similar complexity is inconsistent among inspectors. The factor information (e.g. weather, temperature, labour, and equipment) is not being recorded daily in some diaries. When factor information is recorded, it is inconsistent in detail. Daily records are not consistently signed by inspectors. Also, there were instances of briefing notes in the field memo notebooks not being transcribed to diaries. In some diaries, the notes are difficult to read because of the handwriting. **Recommendation** 1. Complete a review of the current guidance, involving other inspectors in the creation and update, and create guidelines for construction documentation. Guidance would provide reasons for level of detail required and examples of what is considered appropriate. Also, the use of a line and signature at the end of the notes (as opposed to the bottom of the second page) prevents amendments to notes after the fact. Consider using City of Welland's procedures manual as a base. In conjunction with creating guidance, design and implement a quality assurance process for construction documentation.	Create and update existing procedures for inspectors to include a more detailed outline of required information in the daily logs. This is to include a more standardized sheet in the inspector logs for equipment/labour. Additional emphasis will be put on project managers to review and approve the daily logs on a monthly basis with the addition of required signoffs (daily by inspector on site, monthly by PM reviewing log).	31-Mar-19		**April 30, 2019:** Draft procedure is complete and being reviewed for comment. Implementation scheduled for June/July for 2019 construction program. **Auditor's Note:** with work in progress, the expected resolution date is not changing. Follow up with Manager scheduled for end of May to confirm procedures documented and implemented. **December 31, 2018:** No change at this time. Work is scheduled to commence on this during the winter down time so that it can be in place at the commencement of the 2019 construction season. **October 15, 2018:** Report recently issued.	30		Manager of Design and Construction and Project Manager

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
							Details of Audit Issue					**Number**		
F	Capital Works	Design & Construction	Construction Field Inspection	17-Sep-18	4	Medium	**Construction Inspection Documentation:** Field memo books are used by inspectors to make brief notes of on-site activity for transcription to more detailed notes in the construction diary. These memo books have not been categorized according to the Records Retention by-law, so the appropriate retention has not been determined. Currently, the field memo books are kept by the inspectors for extended periods and are not stored with other project documents. Construction diaries are kept by, and with, the inspector until the project is complete (that is, until deficiencies have been corrected). For three of the projects considered complete (that is, the project documents were in off-site storage), the construction diaries remained with the inspector rather than with the project documentation. **Recommendation:** 1. Review the Records Retention By-law to determine the appropriate category for field memo books. Once determined, document the business rationale for the decision including what is considered the trigger event and final disposition of documents, communicate to staff, and implement the appropriate disposition for existing field memo books. As a suggestion, you may want to review "Transitory Records" to see if this description is appropriate for these documents. 2. Update guidance to include when and where final construction diaries are to be stored. Create and implement use a checklist to ensure key elements of the project files are appropriately retained and stored. 3. Collect construction diaries for project files already off-site and include in files (details of affected projects provided separately).	Confirm the process required for the retention of Field memo books and include procedure for all field documentation in the project close out process.	30-Jun-19		**April 30, 2019:** No change at this time. **December 31, 2018:** No change at this time. **October 15, 2018:** Report recently issued.	0		Manager of Design and Construction
G	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	1	Medium	There is no overall long-term (3 to 5 year) strategy and implementation plan to describe: The City's current environment, The goals, objectives and principles for future state of health, safety and wellness within the City, How these goals and objectives align to corporate strategy, The level of risk the organization is willing to tolerate with respect to health, safety and wellness, The programs, resources, and timelines needed to accomplish the objectives, and Relevant leading and lagging performance measures. **Recommendations:** Conduct a facilitated strategy workshop involving stakeholders (i.e. JHSC representation, directors/managers, employees) to identify and formulate the key goals and objectives for health, safety and wellness in the City, considering broader strategic goals and legislative requirements. This discussion could start with strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats to describe the current environment and support discussion of future state and the desired timeframe for achieving future state. Reference to the DuPont™ Bradley Curve™ may provide some guidance to defining the future state.	We will conduct meetings involving the various stakeholders to identify and formulate vision and 3-5 year strategy for HS&W in the City, considering broader strategic goals and legislative requirements.	31-Dec-19		**April 30, 2019:** An email has been sent to 20 staff from across the City to participate in strategy workshops. Thomas Plant from our Project Management Office has agreed to assist us in conducting the strategy workshop(s). Lagging Indicators (measures) have been reported to BLT and various JHSCs. **February 28, 2019:** Report recently issued.	0		Health and Safety Coordinator

Ref #	Department	Function	Audit Report	Audit Report Date	Audit Finding Number	Risk Rating	Summary	Summary of Management Response	Expected Resolution Date	Revised Resolution Date	Status	Days Past Due	Times End Date Revised	Owner
							Details of Audit Issue					**Number**		
H	Human Resources	Health, Safety & Wellness	Health, Safety & Wellness	3-Dec-18	4	Medium	Training - Ont Reg 297/13: OHSA&T defines basic requirements for workers and supervisors. For 6 of the 48 employees' training records, at least one of the required awareness or WHMIS courses have not been competed. In one case, the supervisor awareness training was not assigned, and the employee has been a supervisor for at least 3 years. In 2 cases, the worker awareness training was assigned yet not completed, and the employees have worked for the City for over 3 years. In the remaining 3 cases, the WHMIS training was assigned yet not completed, and one employee is new to the City and the other 2 have been with the city for over 4 years. CHSS Communication- Within the sample of employees, the assigned review for communications of corporate health and safety standards is inconsistent. Five of the 48 employees have not completed review of CHSS communications as assigned through OTR. Monitoring - Close to 20% of the sampled employees had some form of incomplete event, be it training or review of CHSS. Through interviews, it is apparent there is a weakness in the monitoring process**.** **Recommendation:** Re-confirm business rules for assigning training and CHSS communications through OTR. Distribute exception reporting to people managers/supervisors first. Set a threshold for length of time incomplete (e.g. 3 months) for escalation to director of department and director of HR. Re-affirm with employees and people managers their responsibility for completing training, reviewing communications, and monitoring and follow up of training, is a component of performing successfully in their role.	Departments must ensure that their staff completes the required training and sign-offs. Monthly exception reports to now be sent to Managers through Our Training Room as well as the Directors (already occurring). In June 2019, Corporate Health and Safety Standards will be on the BLT agenda (re: implementation successes and challenges). H&S to further investigate legislated training deficiencies and notify management accordingly.	30-Jun-19		**April 30, 2019:** Monthly exception reports have been built to be sent to Managers and Directors automatically for Regulatory Training (some of these already exist). In addition to creating the automated reports in OTR, H&S has audited regulatory training for WHMIS, Worker and Supervisor H&S Awareness. Management teams have been made aware of deficiencies and we have been sending follow-up reports with updated lists. Some progress is being made. **February 28, 2019:** Report recently issued.	0		Health and Safety Coordinator
I	Fire	Communications	Fire Emergency Communications	1-Mar-19	3	Medium	**Issue Identification, Tracking & Reporting:** Issues can occur with people, process or technology. System-related issues are submitted through the City's IT Helpdesk software enabling tracking, notification of closure, and trend analysis. Other issues are communicated verbally or through email between either of the platoon chiefs or public safety telecommunicators and the supervisor. Email tends to be the primary method communication because of the shift work. The content of the emails varies depending on the issue and submitter. The supervisor began simple tracking of the requests in latter part of 2018. A standardized issue reporting process and feedback loop are not in place. **Recommendations:** Define and implement a standardized process and tools for reporting, tracking, recording resolution, and communicating to support trend analysis and information sharing for all service clients.	To investigate tools or systems that could be implemented to improve the process for reporting, tracking and recording resolutions of issues. If funding is required for a solution, this will be submitted as part of the 2020 budget process for Council's consideration. In the interim, an Excel spreadsheet has been set up in a restricted shared fire department folder for reporting, tracking and recording resolution of issues. This interim solution will remain in place until a long-term viable solution can be implemented.	31-Jul-20		**April 2019:** report recently issued**.** Regular follow-up scheduled for end of August.	0		Manager Fire Administration and Communications