

City of Burlington Private Tree By-law 02-2020: Supplemental Information

June 10, 2021

Steve Robinson, OALA, ISA, TRAQ
Manager, Urban Forestry
City of Burlington

Melissa Torchia, ISA, TRAQ, BHA
Supervisor, Forest Protection
City of Burlington



PROGRAM DESIGN

- Original Program designed to be revenue neutral; net zero impact to tax base.
 - Considered a 'Fee for Service' program
- Current Program fee structure cannot achieve net zero impact.
 - Estimated at a 70% tax support; 30% fee for service.
- Option 3 (Staff Recommendation) based on a 'permit per tree' vs 'permit per application' approach;
 - 70% of cost collected through user fees
 - Remaining 30% costs funded from tax base
 - *This is what is budgeted in the approved 2021 City Operating Budget.



FEE STRUCTURE

Original Program designed as ‘Permit per Application’ Approach

- Includes Two-Tiered Costing Model:
 - Development (Building Permit) (\$680.00 per property)
 - Non-Development (\$390 per property)

Unintentional Inequities Introduced:

- Single tree removal vs Several trees pay same permit fees
- No incentive to retain trees
- Replacement costs would still differ*

‘Permit Per Tree’ Approach

- Residents removing one tree would pay a lower fee than residents removing many.
- Sliding cost scale creates a disincentive for clear cutting



MUNICIPAL SCAN

Table 7: Other Municipal Programs (Private Tree By-law)

Municipality	Provisions	Fees	Compensation	Tax Supported (Yes or No)
Town of Oakville	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15cm or greater 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$55 for first tree (15 to 24 cm DBH) • \$355 for each additional tree or tree(s) 24cm DBH + • \$750 for second tree associated with development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1 tree per 10cm DBH of healthy tree removed. • \$300 per compensation tree *deposit held 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes
City of Toronto	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 30cm or greater 	<p>Non-construction:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$123.55 per tree • Boundary/Neighbour Tree: \$257.91 per tree <p>Construction:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$369.61 per tree • Boundary/Neighbour Tree: \$773.77 per tree 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1:1 or 3:1 ratio • \$583 per compensation tree 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yes
City of Mississauga	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Three (3) or more trees 15cm or greater 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$434.40 base permit fee • \$98.09 for each additional tree 15cm + 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 1:1 for 0-49cm • 2:1 for 50cm + • Compensation amount determined by the City *deposit held 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No • ** program is under review



PROGRAM COST CONSIDERATIONS

	2021 Budget	OPTION 1: 70% Tax Support (Do Nothing)	OPTION 1A: 70% Tax Support	OPTION 3: 30% Tax Support	OPTION 5: 50% Tax Support
Permit Type		Per Application	Per Tree	Per Tree	Per Tree
Expenses	583,500	583,500	583,500	583,500	583,500
Revenues	400,000	166,300	173,700	396,600	291,700
Net Budget	183,500	417,200	409,800	186,900	291,800
% Tax Supported	31%	71%	70%	32%	50%
Impact to Budget / Tax Impact %		+ \$233,700 (0.12%)	+ \$226,300 (0.12%)	+ \$3,400 (0.0%)	+ \$108,300 (0.06%)



PERMIT FEE COMPARISONS

	OPTION 1: 70 % Tax Support (Do Nothing)	OPTION 1 A: 70% Tax Support	OPTION 3: 30% Tax Support	OPTION 5: 50% Tax Support
Permit Type	Per Application	Per Tree	Per Tree	Per Tree
Development Permit	\$680	N/A	N/A	N/A
Non-Development Permit	\$390	N/A	N/A	N/A
Application Fee	N/A	\$100	\$100	\$100
1st Removal (general)				
	N/A	\$125	\$350	\$225
2nd & subsequent Removals				
	N/A	\$250	\$750	\$500
1st Removal (construction related)				
	N/A	\$200	\$550	\$450
2nd & subsequent Removals				
	N/A	\$250	\$750	\$500
Tree Injury	N/A	\$100	\$275	\$225
Misc.				
Cash in Lieu of Replacement	\$400	\$400	\$400	\$400
Permit Extension/Renewal Fee	N/A	\$100	\$100	\$100
Compliance Inspection Fee	\$680	\$945	\$945	\$945

INDIRECT COST ANALYSIS

- Applicants required to retain a qualified arborist to complete an arborist report and tree preservation plan
- Applicants incur additional costs for tree removal depending on scope of work.
- Two scenarios presented in Memo: New home construction and General Tree Removal
- New Home Construction (assumed removal of two trees): \$6,500 - \$11,600 incurred indirect cost. Approximately 1.3 – 2.3 % of construction cost
- General Tree Removal (assumed removal of one tree; no arborist report required): \$2,825 - \$5,050 incurred indirect cost.



STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Shift from a 'Permit per Application' to 'Permit per Tree Approach'

- Provides Greater Equity for residents
- Provides disincentive for mass tree removal

Approve Option 3 – 70% Fee for Service; 30% Tax Support

- Reasonable Fees Established for program administration
- New fee structure cost to the tax base is consistent with what was approved in the 2021 Operating Budget
- Fees consistent with other municipalities



QUESTIONS & ANSWERS

