



SUBJECT: Proposed inclusion of downtown properties on the City of Burlington Heritage Register

TO: Community Planning, Regulation & Mobility Cttee.

FROM: Community Planning Department

Report Number: PL-59-22

Wards Affected: 2

File Numbers: 501-06

Date to Committee: September 13, 2022

Date to Council: September 20, 2022

Recommendation:

Direct the Director of Community Planning to add the following list of properties to the Municipal Heritage Register and provide notice to the owner of the property within 30 days, pursuant to section 27(5) of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. O.18;

353-355 Brant Street
357 Brant Street
359 Brant Street
372-374 Brant Street
380 Brant Street
422 Burlington Avenue
426 Burlington Avenue
437 Burlington Avenue
437 Elizabeth Street
441 Elizabeth Street
468 Elizabeth Street
404-408 John Street
1415 Lakeshore Road
2003 Lakeshore Road
458 Locust Street
488 Locust Street
492 Locust Street
513 Locust Street

524 Locust Street
2010 Maria Street
1445 Ontario Street
431 Pearl Street
435 Pearl Street
436 Pearl Street; and

Authorize the City Clerk to take necessary action if there are any objections in accordance with Section 27(7) of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Chapter 0.18 and report back no later than 120 days after notices are sent out presenting all of the objections received; and

Following study completion, direct the Director of Community Planning to re-assess the eligibility of the above listed properties for continued inclusion on the Heritage Register and report back to City Council with a recommendation.

PURPOSE:

This report responds to a motion from the July 12, 2022 City Council meeting directing staff to work with the Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee (“HBAC”) to study all properties in the six potential downtown Cultural Heritage Landscapes (“CHLs”) identified in report number PL-49-22 to determine which properties should be included on the City of Burlington Municipal Register of Cultural Heritage Resources (the “Heritage Register”). The report recommends that 24 properties be added to the Heritage Register.

Vision to Focus Alignment:

- Increase economic prosperity and community responsive city growth

Background and Discussion:

Decision History

On July 5, 2022, the Community Planning, Regulation and Mobility standing committee of Council considered [staff report PL-49-22- Proposed Downtown Cultural Heritage Landscapes Study](#), which requested authorization to retain a consultant to complete a year-long study of eight potential heritage properties and six potential cultural heritage landscapes identified in a 2019 Cultural Heritage Resource Assessment of the downtown. Council passed a motion authorizing the study and included an amendment directing planning staff to engage the Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee (HBAC) and review all properties within each potential Cultural Heritage Landscape for possible inclusion on the Heritage Register. Below is the full text of the motion:

Direct the Director of Community Planning to connect with the Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee to reconvene and review each property in the cultural landscapes to determine which should be added to the Municipal Register; and

Report back to the Community Planning, Regulation & Mobility Committee meeting on September 13, 2022.

The amendment addressed a concern that during the study period, significant buildings in one or more CHLs could be demolished, damaging the integrity of the overall landscape. Including a property on the Heritage Register gives it some protection against immediate demolition, since the owner of a heritage registered property must give City Council 60-days-notice of their intention to demolish the building. During the 60-day notice period, City Council may decide whether to heritage designate the building.

Strategy/process

Assessment Methodology

The review of individual properties began with a comparison between current satellite photos of each CHL and fire insurance maps from 1910 and 1924 to identify possible surviving buildings from those years. Building footprints were compared to assess which current buildings had very similar or identical footprints to buildings in 1924 and 1910 (see Appendix A). In addition to the shape and relative size of buildings, fire insurance maps also recorded land use and primary construction materials used for each building, both of which were noted.

In the second stage of the review, staff examined photographs of each building and completed an architectural evaluation. Exterior building materials were compared with those recorded in the 1924 fire insurance plan. The number of original architectural features was estimated based on historic photographs and known characteristics of 19th and early 20th century architectural styles. Staff also estimated the relative impact and quantity of modern alterations.

Each building was then categorized by architectural style using the style guide in Burlington's "Keeping Place: Heritage-based Urban Design Guidelines for Downtown Burlington" document". Significant architectural features were highlighted in the architectural description of each building.

A building was considered eligible for the Heritage Register if it was constructed prior to 1924, retained recognizable original historic features such as original massing, façade design, exterior materials and window openings, and provided it was not altered to the point it was not recognizable as an historic building.

Summary of Potential Heritage Resources in each Cultural Heritage Landscape

SUMMARY TABLE OF EXISTING AND PROPOSED HERITAGE PROPERTIES IN CHLs 1-6			
Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape	Total Number of Properties	Existing Heritage Register Properties	Proposed for Heritage Register
1. Foot of Brant Street	15	3	7
2. Locust Street	18*	8	6
3. Village Square	1	1	N/A
4. Downtown East	20	7	7
5. Lakeshore Road and Burlington Avenue	13	6	4
6. St. Luke's Church & Cemetery	3**	1	N/A
Totals	70	26	24

*447 and 449 Locust are a conjoined building, but separate properties

**One property contains the church & cemetery, the other two are undeveloped lands that extend to the lake and were historically part of the overall property

Listing Statements

The following section contains the results of the evaluation and contains statements explaining why each property is believed to be of cultural heritage value or interest. These statements are required by section 27(6) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and will be provided to the property owners when notices of their property's inclusion on the Heritage Register are sent out.

Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape 1- Foot of Brant Street

The Foot of Brant Street contains 15 properties developed with 2-3 storey retail, commercial and mixed-use buildings. Three properties are already on the register and seven additional properties are recommended for inclusion:

CHL 1- FOOT OF BRANT STREET CANDIDATES

1.		380 Brant Street Built c.1860 (the “Raymond Hotel”). Three storey masonry commercial building believed to have historical value for its age and former hotel use. Architectural merits include its Italianate details like corner quoins, round-arched windows with keystones, segmental arched windows at second storey, masonry chimneys, cubic massing. Contextual value as a landmark.
2.		372-374 Brant Street. Built before 1910. Two-storey masonry clad commercial building. The property is believed to have historical value for its age and former uses as an undertaker and furniture store. The building is believed to have design value for its gable roof massing, masonry sidewalls, prominent demising wall, cornice and decorative brackets.
3.		359 Brant Street- Built before 1910. Three-storey retail and office building believed to have historical value for its age and former use as an Ontario Department of Agriculture Office. The building is believed to have design value for its Italian renaissance elements including round arched windows at third storey. The second storey originally had round arched windows and the arches and keystones of these windows are still visible in brickwork. The cornice with brackets is still intact along with the dentil course below the cornice brackets. The rectangular second storey windows are not original, but still over 100 years old.

4.		357 Brant Street- Built before 1910. Three-storey building believed to have historical potential for its age and former uses as a mixed-use retail and residential building. The building may have architectural value if surface alterations and non-original cladding can be removed. Nominated for inclusion on the Heritage Register by HBAC.
5.		353-355 Brant Street- Built before 1910. Two-storey building believed to have historical value for its age and former use for retail. The building is believed to have architectural value for its original form, scale and massing, segmental arched windows, stone or concrete sills.
6a)		2003 Lakeshore Road a) 1800s or early 1900s two-storey commercial building believed to have historical value for its age and former use as the Bell Telephone Exchange. The building is believed to have architectural value for its original upper storey window arrangement and intact segmental arched windows with stone or concrete sills. The façade was formerly exposed brick and is now painted stucco.
6b)		2003 Lakeshore Road b) Post war one-storey stone clad former bank building believed to have historical value for its former use. The building is believed to have architectural value as a rare example of a transitional style “modernist” bank with minimalist classical references including “fluted” pilasters. The building has a simplified cornice, sandstone exterior and original fenestration. The style was characteristic of banks in the postwar decade as they sought to portray themselves as architecturally progressive but cautious in approach.

7.		404 John Street- Built between 1910-1924. This two-storey masonry mixed-use building is believed to have historical value for its age and former use as an urban dwelling. It is believed to have design value for its symmetrical two-bay façade featuring segmental arched windows and rusticated stone or concrete sills. 408 John Street- Built 1912. This two-storey masonry building with historical value for its former use as the Hannon Flour and Feed store. It is believed to have design value for its masonry exterior, utilitarian detailing and segmental arched windows with rusticated stone or concrete sills at second storey.
----	---	--

Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape 2- Locust Street

Locust Street is a primarily residential streetscape characterized mainly by one-and-a-half and two-storey homes. It features a total of 18 properties, eight of which are already on the Heritage Register. Six additional properties are proposed to be added:

CHL 2- LOCUST STREET CANDIDATES		
1.		524 Locust Street. Built before 1910. This 1-storey house form building is believed to have historical value for its age, and design value for its Victorian vernacular details including two-over-two windows, segmental arched windows, prominent sills, fieldstone foundation and entrance with sidelights.
2.		513 Locust Street. Built in 1886. This two-storey vernacular house is believed to have design value for its Victorian/Gothic porch details, hipped roof, segmental arched ground floor windows and stone foundation. It is believed to have historical value for its potential to yield information about Burlington's residential neighbourhoods in the late 1800s.

3.		492 Locust Street. North half built before 1910, south half built between 1924 and 1950s. HBAC recommends this property for inclusion on the Heritage Register for its design value, present in original features at the ground and second storey. The original detailing on the north half of the building includes round and segmental arched windows and fish-scale shingled gable with half round window opening. HBAC also believes the property has historical value for its significant age and mixed-use function.
4.		488 Locust Street. Built before 1910. This property is believed to have architectural value for its Victorian Vernacular features including a covered porch, bay window, round arched window in the second-storey gable and two-over-two sash windows. It is believed to have historical value for its significant age and potential to yield information about Burlington's residential neighbourhoods before 1910.
5.		1445 Ontario Street. Built between 1910 and 1924. This property is believed to have historical value for its architectural value as a 1.5-storey vernacular bungalow with covered porch supported with classical (Tuscan) columns. A half bay window on the east side of the front elevation introduces some asymmetry to the facade. Above the porch is a gabled dormer with double-hung one-over-one sash windows. It is believed to have historical value for its potential to yield information about Burlington's residential neighbourhoods in the early 20th century.

6.		458 Locust Street. Built before 1910. This two-storey masonry dwelling is believed to have architectural value for its Queen Anne revival style details including fish scale shingles in gable and segmental arched window at second storey. is believed to have historical value for its potential to yield information about Burlington's residential neighbourhoods before 1910. Alterations include the enclosed the porch at ground storey.
----	---	--

Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape 3- Village Square

Village Square consists of a single property and is already listed on the City's Heritage Register.

Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape 4- Downtown East

CHL 4 is the largest study area and is made up of a mix of building types including a utility service building, former police station, religious buildings and houses. There are 20 properties total in the study area, including seven that are already on the Heritage Register. Seven additional properties in CHL 4 are recommended for inclusion on the Heritage Register:

CHL 4- DOWNTOWN EAST CANDIDATES		
1.		2010 Maria Street This two-storey masonry building is believed to have historical value for its former use as a police station. It is believed to have design value for its mid-century modernist details including long horizontal windows at ground level. The façade is a mix of brick and tile. Alterations include a reduction in the width of the upper storey windows.

2.		468 Elizabeth Street. Built before 1910. This two storey masonry building has historical value for its age and potential to yield information about Burlington's residential areas in the pre-war period. It is believed to have design value for its vernacular homestead and craftsman details. The house is two bays wide, with entrance positioned at the side of the ground floor. The full width veranda with craftsman style stone base is original. Two-over-two sash windows feature segmental arches.
3.		441 Elizabeth Street- Built after 1924. The Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee believes this building has potential design value for its vernacular homestead details including the gable roof and segmental arched windows. The front façade has been extensively altered.
4.		437 Elizabeth Street. South portion built before 1910. The Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee believes that the original portions of this two storey masonry house have design value for their vernacular homestead details such as segmental arched windows and projecting sills. The house has been significantly altered with a large addition built onto the north side.
5.		436 Pearl Street. Original portion built before 1910. The Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee believes this building has some potential historical value due to its local reputation and conversion from a two-storey gable roof house to a popular restaurant. Extensively altered with ground storey additions. Second storey has been re-clad and no window openings remain.

6.		435 Pearl Street. Built in the mid-late 1800s. This two-storey house is believed to have design value for its gothic vernacular detailing including gingerbread trim accenting a peaked dormer in the roof. The dormer features a round arched window centred over the main entry. Front box bay windows are likely not original.
7.		431 Pearl Street. Built before 1910. This two-storey wood frame house is believed to have design value for its vernacular homestead details including an asymmetrical façade and square headed, one-over-one sash windows.

Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape 5- Burlington Avenue & Lakeshore Road

CHL 5 is made up of one-and-a-half and two-storey houses. Burlington Avenue is recognized as a significant component of downtown Burlington, taking its name from Burlington village. The tree-lined avenue was developed under three subdivision plans, the first of which was William Bunton's survey registered in 1881. There are 13 properties in the study area, including six that are already on the Heritage Register. Four additional properties in CHL 5 are recommended for inclusion on the Heritage Register:

CHL 5- BURLINGTON AVENUE & LAKESHORE ROAD CANDIDATES		
1.		437 Burlington Avenue. This two-and-a-half storey masonry dwelling is believed to have design value for its rich Italianate details including red brick with buff brick accents around the window arches resembling a hood mould with a keystone. Full arched windows at second storey with segmental arched windows at the ground-storey. The house features carved Victorian style trim in the main gable and decorative brackets

		accenting the eaves of the half bay window and porch at the ground storey.
2.		426 Burlington Avenue. Built before 1924. This 1.5 storey house is believed to have design value for its craftsman style details including its broad verandah with grouped square columns and masonry pedestals. To the left of the doorway are three six-over-one sash windows. The house also has a distinctive jerkinhead roof with knee brackets.
3.		422 Burlington Avenue. Built after 1924, but likely during the 1920s. This one-and-a-half storey bungalow is believed to have design value for its distinctive craftsman details including a full width verandah with Tuscan columns, an asymmetrical façade with doorway to one side of a set of four six-over-one windows. The house also has a distinctive jerkinhead roof.
4.		1415 Lakeshore Road. Built before 1924. This one-and-a-half storey house is believed to have design value for its craftsman features including a full width porch featuring simplified square posts. The main entry is accentuated by a gable with knee brackets. Horizontal wood cladding is a typical craftsman style feature. All windows on front façade have been replaced.

Potential Cultural Heritage Landscape 6- St. Luke's Church & Cemetery

CHL 6 is St. Luke's Church and Cemetery at 1371 Elgin Street. The property is already on the Heritage Register.

Possible Objections

Under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the owner of a property included on the heritage register can object to the listing by serving a notice of objection on the clerk of the municipality setting out the reasons for the objection and all relevant facts. There is no deadline for an objection. If a notice is served, City Council must consider the notice and decide if the property should continue to be included in the register or whether it should be removed.

There is a strong possibility that with Council adding 24 properties to the Heritage Register at once, the City will receive multiple objections. Staff are recommending that Council direct staff to report back no later than 120 days after sending out notices to give staff enough time to gather most or all objections to the register listings before reporting back. This will enable Council to consider multiple objections together as a more efficient process and use of resources rather than consider each objection individually.

Options Considered

Option 1- Add all properties recommended by staff and the Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee to the Heritage Register, re-assess at the end of the study

This option is recommended because it best responds to Council's direction to deliver a list of Heritage Register candidates that includes both staff and HBAC's recommendations. HBAC had recommended five more properties than staff, including 357 Brant Street, 492 Locust Street, 437 Elizabeth Street, 436 Pearl Street and 441 Elizabeth Street. Both Staff and HBAC recommend that at the end of the study, all properties be re-assessed for continued inclusion on the Heritage Register because the study is likely to reveal more in-depth historical information about individual properties and areas that could alter the City's opinion of their importance.

Option 2- Add only properties recommended by staff

This option is not recommended because it does not include the advice of HBAC, who gave important input to this review.

Option 3- Decline to add any properties to the Heritage Register

The review of individual properties uncovered many buildings with significant design value, as well as properties that have the potential to yield important information about Burlington's history of urban development and land use patterns. This option is not recommended because it would leave important properties in each potential cultural heritage landscape with no protection.

Financial Matters:

Total Financial Impact

Funding to undertake this study was approved as part of report PL-49-22.

Other Resource Impacts

The addition of these properties to the Heritage Register will require staff to create 20 notices to send to each property owner. After owners receive the notice they may contact staff for clarification, and they may file an objection, which will require staff to write a report(s) to Council with a recommendation(s).

Climate Implications

Not applicable.

Engagement Matters:

Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee

Staff prepared the initial assessments of individual properties and gave them to the HBAC Committee Evaluations Subcommittee for review. After the Evaluations Subcommittee reviewed, they prepared recommendations for the larger Committee (See Appendix C- Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee- Evaluations Subcommittee Summary Chart). HBAC met on July 27 at 7PM (See Appendix B-Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee Minutes- July 27, 2022) to discuss the nominations. HBAC recommended five properties in addition to the ones staff recommended. The full wording of the HBAC motion is as follows:

Heritage Burlington recommends that City Council add the following staff recommended properties to the Municipal Heritage Register:

- 380 Brant Street
- 372-374 Brant Street
- 359 Brant Street
- 353-355 Brant Street
- 2003 Lakeshore Road (Buildings A & B)
- 404-408 John Street
- 524 Locust Street
- 513 Locust Street
- 488 Locust Street
- 1445 Ontario Street
- 458 Locust Street
- 2010 Maria Street
- 468 Elizabeth Street

- 435 Pearl Street
- 431 Pearl Street
- 437 Burlington Avenue
- 426 Burlington Avenue
- 422 Burlington Avenue
- 1415 Lakeshore Road; and

That the following additional properties be added to the Municipal Heritage Register, as recommended by Heritage Burlington:

- 357 Brant Street
- 492 Locust Street
- 437 Elizabeth Street
- 441 Elizabeth Street
- 436 Pearl Street; and

That following study completion, staff re-assess the eligibility of the above listed properties for continued inclusion on the Heritage Register and report back to City Council with a recommendation.

Conclusion:

A review of all properties in potential CHLs 1-6 has revealed 24 properties that are believed to have heritage value or interest. Adding the properties to the Heritage Register has limited regulatory impacts on owners but provides some protection against demolition while the Downtown Cultural Heritage Landscapes study is underway. At the end of the study, staff will re-assess the properties and report back to Council with a recommendation on the eligibility of the properties for continued inclusion on the Heritage Register.

Respectfully submitted,

John O'Reilly, MCIP, RPP
Planner II - Heritage
(905) 335-7777 ext. 7427

Appendices:

- A. Heritage Property Evaluations, CHLs 1,2,4 & 5 (PL-59-22)
- B. Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee Minutes- July 26, 2022 (PL-59-22)

C. Heritage Burlington Advisory Committee- Evaluations Subcommittee Summary Chart (PL-59-22)

Notifications:

Owners of: 353-355 Brant Street, 357 Brant Street, 359 Brant Street, 372-374 Brant Street, 380 Brant Street, 422 Burlington Avenue, 426 Burlington Avenue, 437 Burlington Avenue, 437 Elizabeth Street, 441 Elizabeth Street, 468 Elizabeth Street, 404-408 John Street, 1415 Lakeshore Road, 2003 Lakeshore Road (both buildings), 458 Locust Street, 488 Locust Street, 492 Locust Street, 513 Locust Street, 524 Locust Street, 2010 Maria Street, 436 Pearl Street, 1445 Ontario Street, 431 Pearl Street, 435 Pearl Street

Report Approval:

All reports are reviewed and/or approved by Department Director, the Chief Financial Officer and the Executive Director of Legal Services & Corporation Counsel.